

A comparison between the St Andrew's Draft of the Anglican Covenant and the Nassau and Church of England versions.

Introduction

The purpose of this paper is to compare the new St Andrew's draft of the Anglican Covenant with the earlier Nassau text and the version submitted by the Archbishops of Canterbury and York on behalf of the Church of England.

At first sight the new numbering system adopted by the St Andrew's text makes it look a very different text from the Nassau draft on which the Church of England material was based. However, the St Andrew's draft is in reality substantially the same as the Nassau draft in both content and order, a fact which makes comparing the Nassau, St Andrew's and Church of England texts a fairly straightforward exercise as the sections of these three texts can be set alongside each other in a synoptic fashion.

What I shall do in this paper is set down the three versions of the Covenant text, section by section, following the order of the Nassau draft, with the Nassau text first, then the Church of England text and finally the new St Andrew's draft. In the St Andrew's text, material from the Nassau text will be in ordinary type, material taken from the Church of England version will be in bold and the new material from the Covenant Design Group (CDG) will be in italics. I will then comment on the differences between the texts. The commentary will be in Arial.

The paper concludes with two appendixes and a summary. The first appendix contains the draft appendix from the St Andrew's text setting out proposed procedures for handling disputes within the Anglican Communion and a brief commentary on these proposals. The second appendix contains some comments from Dr Ephraim Radner, a member of the CDG explaining why emphasis is now being given to the ACC rather than the Primates Meeting. Finally, the summary attempts to give a brief initial assessment of the St Andrew's text and the issues that it raises.

1. Introduction

Nassau Text

An Introduction to a Draft Text for an Anglican Covenant

God has called us into communion in Jesus Christ (1 Cor. 1:9; 1 Jn. 1:3). This call is established in God's purposes for creation (Eph. 1:10; 3:9ff.), which have been furthered in God's covenants with Israel and its representatives such as Abraham and most fully in the life, death, and resurrection of Christ Jesus. We humbly recognize that this calling and gift of communion grants us responsibilities for our common life before God.

Through God's grace we have been given the Communion of Anglican churches through which to respond to God's larger calling in Christ (Acts 2:42). This Communion provides us with a special charism and identity among the many followers and servants of Jesus. Recognizing the wonder, beauty and challenge of

maintaining communion in this family of churches, and the need for mutual commitment and discipline as a witness to God's promise in a world and time of instability, conflict, and fragmentation, we covenant together as churches of this Anglican Communion to be faithful to God's promises through the historic faith we confess, the way we live together and the focus of our mission.

Our faith embodies a coherent testimony to what we have received from God's Word and the Church's long-standing witness; our life together reflects the blessings of God in growing our Communion into a truly global body; and the mission we pursue aims at serving the great promises of God in Christ that embrace the world and its peoples, carried out in shared responsibility and stewardship of resources, and in interdependence among ourselves and with the wider Church.

Our prayer is that God will redeem our struggles and weakness, and renew and enrich our common life so that the Anglican Communion may be used to witness effectively in all the world to the new life and hope found in Christ

Church of England text

An Introduction to a Draft Text for an Anglican Covenant

'This life is revealed, and we have seen it and testify to it, and declare to you the eternal life that was with the Father and was revealed to us – we declare to you what we have seen and heard so that you also may have fellowship with us; and truly our fellowship is with the Father and with his Son Jesus Christ (1 John 1:2-3).

By this we know that we abide in him and he in us, because he has given us of his Spirit' (1 John 4:13).

What is the life revealed to us? St John makes it clear that the fellowship or communion (*koinonia*) of life in the Church reflects the communion that is the divine life itself, the life of the Trinity. This is not the revelation of a reality remote from us, for in the communion of the Church we share in the divine life. The communion manifested in the life of the Church has the Trinitarian fellowship as its basis, model and ultimate goal. Conversely, the communion of the Persons of the Holy Trinity creates, structures and expounds the mystery of the communion experienced in the Church. It is within and by the Church that we come to know the Trinity and by the Trinity we come to understand the Church because 'the Church is full of Trinity.'¹

The Holy Scriptures tell us that in seeking communion with humankind despite our rebellion and sin, God made covenants with Noah, Abraham, Israel and David. His aim was to bless all nations as they responded to his invitation to live in communion with him, so that he might restore his image in them.

In Jesus there is now another covenant: "this is my blood of the covenant, poured out for many for the forgiveness of sins" (Matt 26:28). In this covenant we find a renewed communion with God as we share with others the forgiveness of sins through Jesus.

¹ *The Church of the Triune God* Paragraphs 1- 3

We discover our communion with others in mission through Christ, and our mission is to spread the communion of Christ, ultimately with the whole of creation.

Those who are in communion with God through Jesus Christ form one universal Church which is called to be: ‘through the work of the Spirit, an anticipatory sign of God’s healing and restorative future for the world. Those who, despite their own sinfulness, are saved by grace through their faith in God’s gospel (Eph. 2:1-10) are to live as a united family across traditional ethnic and other boundaries (2:11-12), and so are to reveal the wisdom of the one true God to the hostile and divisive powers of the world (3:9-10) as they explore and celebrate the love of God made known through Christ’s dwelling in their hearts (3:14-21). The redeemed unity which is God’s will for the whole creation is to be lived out within the life of the Church as, through its various God-given ministries, it is built up as the Body of Christ and grows to maturity not least through speaking the truth in love (1:10, 22-23; 4:1-16).’²

In the providence of God, which operates in spite of the divisions caused by sin, various families of churches have grown up within the universal Church during the course of its history. Among these families is the Anglican Communion, which provides us our special charism and identity among the many followers and servants of Jesus. Three important characteristics of this special charism and identity are a distinctive Anglican theological method, distinctive Anglican patterns of leadership and decision-making and a distinctive Anglican liturgical tradition.

Theological Method

Anglican theological method is rooted in the teaching of Holy Scripture, ‘the fountain and well of truth,’³ containing all things necessary to salvation and constituting the rule and ultimate standard of faith, and recognizes the need for a communal reading of Scripture that is informed by biblical scholarship

It gives due weight to the witness to divine truth borne by the created order and the Catholic tradition (with particular importance being attached to the Catholic Creeds, the teaching of the Fathers of the first five centuries and the three ‘historic formularies’ – the Thirty Nine Articles, the Book of Common Prayer and the Ordinal - that emerged out of the English Reformation).

It involves the use of reason, renewed by the Holy Spirit. ‘In vain were it to speak any thing of God, but that by reason men are able to judge of that they hear, and by discourse to discern how consonant it is to truth.’⁴

Finally, it accepts the obligation to proclaim the Apostolic faith afresh in each generation. This involves fidelity to the witness of Scripture, the created order, and the Catholic tradition in the context of the different cultures, societies and situations in which Anglicans are called to live, serve, worship and evangelise. Learning to proclaim the Apostolic faith afresh involves a process of study and debate within the Church because it means the emergence of new ideas and approaches, some of which, even though perceived as controversial when they arise, will lead to a deeper

² *Windsor Report* Paragraph 2

³ Thomas Cranmer *A Fruitful Exhortation to the Reading and Knowledge of Holy Scripture*.

⁴ Richard Hooker *Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity* III.VIII.11

understanding of the implications of God's revelation to us, others of which will ultimately prove to be distractions or even obstacles to the faith and all of which need to be tested by a process of shared discernment in the life of the Church.

Patterns of leadership and decision-making

This process of shared discernment in the life of the Church takes place within the framework provided by distinctive Anglican patterns of leadership and decision-making.

In accordance with the tradition of the Church going back to Apostolic times, the bishops of Anglican Communion are called to lead their churches in mission. They have a responsibility for teaching the Apostolic faith, acting as the chief ministers of the sacraments, exercising pastoral oversight and symbolizing and maintaining the unity of the Church. Their ministry is exercised in a personal, collegial and communal way.⁵

The collegial and communal aspects of episcopal ministry are exercised in consultation with other bishops and with representatives of the other clergy and of the laity. This consultation takes place through the various synodical structures that exist within the churches of the Anglican Communion and by means of the four 'Instruments of Communion.' These are the instruments of unity and means of communion which link the churches together in order that their common life may be built up and their common mission exercised more effectively. These Instruments of Communion are:

- I. The Archbishop of Canterbury, who, as the Bishop of the See of Canterbury presides in the Anglican Communion as whole, is a locus and means of unity. He exercises a ministry of primacy that involves teaching, the gathering of his fellow bishops to take counsel together, and determining which churches belong to the Anglican Communion. He is the host of the Lambeth Conference and the Primates' Meeting and President of the Anglican Consultative Council.
- II. The Lambeth Conference which, under the presidency of the Archbishop of Canterbury, expresses worldwide episcopal collegiality by gathering the bishops of the Anglican Communion for common counsel, consultation and encouragement and serves as an instrument in guarding the faith and unity of the Communion.
- III. The Primates' Meeting, hosted by the Archbishop of Canterbury, which assembles the presiding bishops of the Communion for mutual support and counsel and acts as the executive committee of the Lambeth Conference. It monitors global developments and works in full collaboration in doctrinal, moral and pastoral matters that have Communion-wide implications.
- IV. The Anglican Consultative Council, which is a body consisting of bishops, clergy and laity from the churches of the Communion. It has a responsibility for fostering mutual responsibility and interdependence within the life of the Communion.

⁵ See *Baptism Eucharist and Ministry*, Ministry III. B.26

The Anglican liturgical tradition

Alongside a distinctive Anglican theological method and distinctive Anglican patterns of leadership and decision making, a third key feature of Anglican identity is a distinctive Anglican liturgical tradition.

This tradition, which can be traced back to the work of Archbishop Thomas Cranmer in the sixteenth century, is a tradition of worship in the vernacular that is rooted in Scripture and also draws on liturgical material from the Patristic, Medieval and Reformation periods. The Book of Common Prayer and the Ordinal attached to it have particular importance within this tradition and are among the three ‘historic formulae,’ which are seen as giving classic expression to the faith which Anglicans share.

The fact that these two liturgical texts are included among the historic formulae reflects the Anglican acceptance of the ancient principle *lex orandi, lex credendi* (the law of praying is the law of believing), in the sense that for Anglicans what is contained in their liturgies has a central role in articulating and defining their common faith and practice.

A shared liturgical tradition has been one of the key factors that has created a sense of common identity amongst Anglican Christians and it has thus played a central role in helping to create and sustain the unity of the Anglican Communion

Recognizing the duty and challenge of maintaining communion in the Anglican family of churches, and the need for mutual commitment and discipline as a witness to God’s promise in a world and time of instability, conflict, and fragmentation, we covenant together as churches of this Anglican Communion to be faithful to God’s promises through the historic faith we confess, the way we live together and the focus of our mission.

Our faith embodies a coherent testimony to what we have received from God’s Word and the Church’s long-standing witness; our life together reflects the blessings of God in growing our Communion into a truly global body; and the mission we pursue aims at serving the great promises of God in Christ that embrace the world and its peoples, carried out in shared responsibility and stewardship of resources, and in interdependence among ourselves and with the wider Church.

Our prayer is that God will redeem our struggles and weakness, and renew and enrich our common life so that the Anglican Communion may be used to witness effectively in all the world to the new life and hope found in Christ.

The St Andrew’s Draft

“This life is revealed, and we have seen it and testify to it, and declare to you the eternal life that was with the Father and was revealed to us – we declare to you what we have seen and heard so that you also may have communion with us; and truly our communion is with the Father and with his Son Jesus Christ” (I John 1.2-3)

1. God has called us into communion in Jesus Christ (1 Cor. 1:9). *This communion has been “revealed to us” by the Son as being the very divine life of God the Trinity. What is the life revealed to us? St John makes it clear that the communion of life in the Church reflects the communion which is the divine life itself, the life of the Trinity. This life is not a reality remote from us, but one that has been “seen” and “testified to” by the Apostles and their followers: “for in the communion of the Church we share in the divine life” (The Church and the Triune God [1] par. 1-2). This life of the One God, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, shapes and displays itself through the very existence and ordering of the Church.*

2. *Our divine calling into communion is established in God’s purposes for the whole of creation (Eph. 1:10; 3:9ff.). It is extended to all humankind, so that, in our sharing of God’s life as Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, God might restore in us his own image. Through time, according to the Scriptures, God has furthered this calling through covenants made with Noah, Abraham, Israel, and David. The prophet Jeremiah looked forward to a new covenant not written on tablets of stone but upon the heart (Jer.31.31-34) In God’s Son Christ Jesus, a new covenant is given us, established in his “blood ... poured out for the many for the forgiveness of sins” (Mt. 26:28), secured through his resurrection from the dead (Eph. 1:19-23), and sealed with the gift of the Holy Spirit poured into our hearts (Rom. 5:5). Into this covenant of death to sin and of new life in Christ we are baptized, and empowered to share God’s communion in Christ with all people, to the very ends of the earth and of creation.*

3. *We humbly recognize that this calling and gift of communion entails responsibilities for our common life before God as we seek, through his grace, to be faithful in our service of his purposes for the world. Joined to one universal Body, who is Christ the Lord, spread throughout the earth, we serve his Gospel even as we are enabled to be made one across the dividing walls of human sin and estrangement (Eph. 2:22-12). The forms of this life in the Church, caught up in the mystery of divine communion, reveal to the hostile and divisive power of the world the “manifold wisdom of God” (Eph. 3:9-10): faithfulness, honesty, gentleness, humility, patience, forgiveness, and love itself, lived out among the Church’s people and through its ministries, contribute to building up the body of Christ as it grows to maturity (Eph. 4:1-16; Col. 3:8-17). (See The Windsor Report, par. 2).*

4. In the providence of God, which holds sway even over our divisions caused by sin, various families of churches have grown up within the universal Church in the course of history. Among these families is the Anglican Communion, which provides us a special charism and identity among the many followers and servants of Jesus. Recognizing the wonder, beauty and challenge of maintaining communion in this family of churches, and the need for mutual commitment and discipline as a witness to God’s promise in a world and time of instability, conflict, and fragmentation, we covenant together as churches of this Anglican Communion to be faithful to God’s promises through the historic faith we confess, the way we live together and the focus of our mission.

5. *To covenant together is not intended to change the character of this Anglican expression of Christian faith. Rather, we recognise the importance of renewing our commitment to one another, and our common understanding of the faith as we have received it in a solemn way, so that the “bonds of affection” which hold us together*

may be affirmed. We do this in order to reflect in our relations with one another God's own faithfulness in his promises towards us in Christ. (2 Cor 1.20-22)

6, We are a people who live, learn, and pray by and with the Scriptures as God's Word. We seek to adore God in thanks and praise and to make intercession for the needs of people everywhere through a common voice, made one across cultures and languages. We are privileged to share in the mission of the apostles to bring the Gospel of Christ to all nations and peoples, not in word only but in deeds of compassion and justice that witness to God's character and the triumph of Christ over sin and death. We give ourselves as servants of a greater unity among the divided Christians of the world. May the Lord help us to "preach not ourselves, but Jesus Christ as Lord, and ourselves as your servants for Jesus' sake" (2 Cor. 4:5).

7. Our faith embodies a coherent testimony to what we have received from God's Word and the Church's long-standing witness; our life together reflects the blessings of God in growing our Communion into a truly global family; and the mission we pursue aims at serving the great promises of God in Christ that embrace the world and its peoples, carried out in shared responsibility and stewardship of resources, and in interdependence among ourselves and with the wider Church.

8. Our prayer is that God will redeem our struggles and weakness, and renew and enrich our common life so that the Anglican Communion may be used to witness effectively in all the world, working with all Christians of good will, to the new life and hope found in Christ Jesus.

1. The Cyprus Statement of the International Commission for Anglican Orthodox Theological Dialogue, 2007.

Commentary

The St Andrew's draft has accepted the idea of an extended introduction and it has used some of the material from the Anglican-Orthodox dialogue contained in the Church of England draft. What it has not done is include the introduction as part of the main text of the covenant or include the material from the Church of England draft on the Anglican theological method, the Anglican pattern of leadership and decision-making or the Anglican liturgical tradition.

2. Preamble

Nassau Text

1. Preamble

(Psalm 127.1-2, Ezekiel 37.1-14, Mark 1.1, John 10.10; Romans 5.1-5, Ephesians 4:1-16, Revelation 2-3)

We, the Churches of the Anglican Communion, under the Lordship of Jesus Christ, solemnly covenant together in these articles, in order to proclaim more effectively in our different contexts the Grace of God revealed in the Gospel, to offer God's love in responding to the needs of the world, to maintain the unity of the Spirit in the bond of

peace, and to grow up together as a worldwide Communion to the full stature of Christ.

Church of England Text

1. Preamble

We, the Churches of the Anglican Communion, under the Lordship of Jesus Christ, covenant together in these articles, in order to proclaim more effectively in our different contexts the Grace of God revealed in the Gospel, to offer God's love in responding to the needs of the world, to maintain the unity of the Spirit in the bond of peace, and, together with all God's people, to grow up to the full stature of Christ.'

The St Andrew's Draft

Preamble

We, the Churches of the Anglican Communion, under the Lordship of Jesus Christ, *solemnly covenant together in these following affirmations and commitments. As people of God, drawn from "every nation, tribe, people and language" [1], we do this* in order to proclaim more effectively in our different contexts the Grace of God revealed in the gospel, to offer God's love in responding to the needs of the world, to maintain the unity of the Spirit in the bond of peace, **and together with all God's people to grow up together to the full stature of Christ.**

Commentary

The St Andrew's draft seeks to tie in the preamble explicitly to the affirmations and commitments that follow. It also uses Rev 7:9 in order to highlight the idea of God's people coming from different social and cultural contexts and takes on board the point made by the Church of England about not identifying the churches of the Anglican Communion with the people of God as a whole.

In the Church of England's comments on the Nassau text it was noted that work needed to be done on what is meant by the term 'church' in Anglican ecclesiology. Does it mean the 38 national or regional churches that currently make up the Anglican Communion or should it properly refer to the dioceses as the fundamental units of Anglican ecclesiology? This issue is not addressed in the new draft but still requires attention, not least because of its implications for the issue of whether a diocese could belong to the Communion even if a national church did not.

3. The life we share

The Nassau text

2 The Life We Share: Common Catholicity, Apostolicity and Confession of Faith (*Deuteronomy 6.4-7, Leviticus 19.9-10, Amos 5.14-15, 24; Matthew 25, 28.16-20, 1 Corinthians 15.3-11, Philipians 2.1-11, 1 Timothy 3:15-16, Hebrews 13.1-17*)

Each member Church, and the Communion as a whole, affirms:

(1) that it is part of the one, holy, catholic, and apostolic Church, worshipping the one true God, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit [1];

(2) that it professes the faith which is uniquely revealed in the Holy Scriptures as containing all things necessary for salvation and as being the rule and ultimate standard of faith [2], and which is set forth in the catholic creeds, which faith the Church is called upon to proclaim afresh in each generation [3];

(3) that it holds and duly administers the two sacraments ordained by Christ himself – Baptism and the Supper of the Lord – ministered with the unfailing use of Christ’s words of institution, and of the elements ordained by him [4];

(4) that it participates in the apostolic mission of the whole people of God;

(5) that, led by the Holy Spirit, it has borne witness to Christian truth in its historic formularies, the Thirty-nine Articles of Religion, the 1662 Book of Common Prayer, and the Ordering of Bishops, Priests, and Deacons [5];

(6) our loyalty to this inheritance of faith as our inspiration and guidance under God in bringing the grace and truth of Christ to this generation and making Him known to our societies and nations [6].

¹ Cf. The Preface to the Declaration of Assent, Canon C15 of the Church of England.

² Cf. The Lambeth Quadrilateral of 1888

³ Cf. The Preface to the Declaration of Assent, Canon C15 of the Church of England.

⁴ cf. The Chicago-Lambeth Quadrilateral 1886/1888, The Preface to the Declaration of Assent, Canon C15 of the Church of England.

⁵ This is not meant to exclude other Books of Common Prayer and Ordinals duly authorised for use throughout the Anglican Communion, but acknowledges the foundational nature of the Book of Common Prayer 1662 in the life of the Communion.

⁶ Cf. The Preface to the Declaration of Assent, Canon C15 of the Church of England.

The Church of England text

2 The Life We Share: Common Catholicity, Apostolicity and Confession of Faith

We recognise in one another:

(1) The one, holy, catholic, and apostolic Church, worshipping the one true God, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit and participating in the apostolic mission of the whole people of God;

(2) Profession of the faith that is uniquely revealed in the Holy Scriptures (which contain all things necessary for salvation and are the rule and ultimate standard of

faith), which is set forth in the catholic creeds, and to which the historic Anglican formularies bear witness.

(3) Loyalty to this inheritance of faith as their inspiration and guidance under God in bringing the grace and truth of Christ to this generation and making Him known to their societies and nations;

(4) Due administration of the sacraments of Baptism and the Supper of the Lord ordained by Christ himself, ministered with the unfailing use of Christ's words of institution, and of the elements ordained by him.

The St Andrew's draft

1.1 Each Church of the Communion affirms:

(1.1.1) its communion in the one, holy, catholic, and apostolic Church, worshipping the one true God, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit[2];

(1.1.2) that, reliant on the Holy Spirit, it professes the faith which is uniquely revealed in the Holy Scriptures of the Old and New Testaments as containing all things necessary for salvation and as being the rule and ultimate standard of faith[3], and which is set forth in the catholic creeds, **and to which the historic formularies of the Church of England[4] bear significant witness**, which faith the Church is called upon to proclaim afresh in each generation[5];

(1.1.3) that it holds and duly administers the two sacraments ordained by Christ himself – Baptism and the Supper of the Lord – ministered with the unfailing use of Christ's words of institution, and of the elements ordained by him[6];

(1.1.4) that it upholds the historic episcopate, locally adapted in the methods of its administration to the varying needs of the nations and peoples called of God into the unity of his Church[7];

(1.1.5) that our shared patterns of common prayer and liturgy form, sustain and nourish our worship of God and our faith and life together;

(1.1.6) that it participates in the apostolic mission of the whole people of God, and that this mission is shared with other Churches and traditions beyond this Covenant.

Commentary

The St Andrew's text has retained the idea of the churches of the Communion making affirmations about themselves rather than following the Church of England's suggested formula of mutual recognition. Sections 1.1.1-1.1.3 are largely drawn from the Nassau text with the exception of the omission of the biblical texts at the beginning (which are also omitted in all subsequent sections), a reference to the Church of England formularies in 1.1.2 adapted from the Church of England text and a quotation from the Declaration of Assent in the same section. Sections 1.1.4-1.1.6, which refer to the historic

episcopate, the importance of liturgy and participation in mission are new, with 1.1.4 using the language of the Lambeth Quadrilateral.

It is unclear why the drafters preferred to talk about the 'Church of England formularies' rather than 'the historic Anglican formularies' or what the significance is of their use of the adjective 'significant' to qualify the term 'witness.'

In 1.1.3 the drafters decided to stick with the language of the Lambeth Quadrilateral and not to take on board the Church of England query about whether this implied a particular view of sacramental theology that not all Anglicans would accept.

3. Our Commitment to the Confession of the Faith

The Nassau Text

3 Our Commitment to Confession of the Faith

(Deuteronomy 30.11-14, Psalm 126, Mark 10.26-27, Luke 1.37, 46-55, John 8: 32, 14:15-17, 1 Corinthians 11.23-26, 2 Timothy 3:10-4:5;)

In seeking to be faithful to God in their various contexts, each Church commits itself to:

- (1) uphold and act in continuity and consistency with the catholic and apostolic faith, order and tradition, biblically derived moral values and the vision of humanity received by and developed in the communion of member Churches;
- (2) seek in all things to uphold the solemn obligation to sustain Eucharistic communion, welcoming members of all other member churches to join in its own celebration, and encouraging its members to participate in the Eucharist in a member church in accordance with the canonical discipline of that host church;
- (3) ensure that biblical texts are handled faithfully, respectfully, comprehensively and coherently, primarily through the teaching and initiative of bishops and synods, and building on the best scholarship, believing that scriptural revelation must continue to illuminate, challenge and transform cultures, structures and ways of thinking;
- (4) nurture and respond to prophetic and faithful leadership and ministry to assist our Churches as courageous witnesses to the transformative power of the Gospel in the world.
- (5) pursue a common pilgrimage with other members of the Communion to discern truth, that peoples from all nations may truly be free and receive the new and abundant life in the Lord Jesus Christ.

The Church of England text

3 Our Commitment to Confession of the Faith

In seeking to be faithful to God in our various contexts, we commit ourselves to:

- (1) uphold and act in continuity and consistency with the catholic and apostolic faith, order and tradition;
- (2) uphold and proclaim a pattern of Christian moral reasoning and discipline that is rooted in, and answerable to, the teaching of Holy Scripture and the Catholic tradition, and that reflects the renewal of humanity and the whole created order through the death and resurrection of Christ and the holiness that in consequence God gives to, and requires from, His people;
- (3) seek in all things to uphold the Christian obligation to sustain Eucharistic communion, welcoming members of all other member churches to join in our own celebrations, and encouraging our members to participate in the Eucharist in another member church in accordance with the canonical discipline of that host church;
- (4) ensure that biblical texts are handled faithfully, respectfully, comprehensively and coherently, primarily through the teaching and initiative of bishops and synods, and building on the best scholarship, in the belief that scriptural revelation must continue to illuminate, challenge and transform cultures, structures and ways of thinking;
- (5) nurture and respond to prophetic and faithful leadership and ministry to assist our churches as courageous witnesses to the transformative power of the Gospel in the world.
- (6) pursue a common pilgrimage with other members of the Communion to discern truth, so that people from all nations may truly be free and receive the new and abundant life that Christ offers .

The St Andrew's draft

1.2 In *living out this* inheritance of faith together in varying contexts, each Church *of the Communion* commits itself:

- (1.2.1) **to uphold and act in continuity and consonance with *Scripture and the catholic and apostolic faith, order and tradition*;**
- (1.2.2) **to uphold and proclaim a pattern of Christian theological and moral reasoning and discipline that is rooted in and answerable to the teaching of Holy Scripture and the catholic tradition and that reflects the renewal of humanity and the whole created order through the death and resurrection of Christ and the holiness that in consequence God gives to, and requires from, his people;**
- (1.2.3) to seek in all things to uphold the solemn obligation to sustain Eucharistic communion, in accordance *with existing canonical disciplines as we strive under God for the fuller realisation of the Communion of all Christians*;
- (1.2.4) to ensure that biblical texts are handled faithfully, respectfully, comprehensively and coherently, primarily through the teaching and initiative of

bishops and synods, *and building on habits and disciplines of Bible study across the Church and on rigorous scholarship*, believing that scriptural revelation *continues* to illuminate and transform individuals, cultures and societies;

(1.2.5) nurture and respond to prophetic and faithful leadership in ministry and mission *to equip God's people to be courageous witnesses to the power of the Gospel in the world.*

(1.2.6) pursue a common pilgrimage with other *Churches* of the Communion to discern *the Truth*, that peoples from all nations may truly be set free to receive the new and abundant life in the Lord Jesus Christ.

Commentary

In 1.2 'living out this inheritance of faith' replaces 'seeking to be faithful to' and it is made clear that the churches committing themselves are churches of the Anglican Communion.

1.2.1-1.2.2 are drawn from the Church of England text with the addition of a reference to 'Scripture' in 1.2.1.

1.2.4 makes reference to varying approaches to Bible study across the Communion and substitutes 'rigorous scholarship' for 'the best scholarship' in the Nassau text.

1.2.3 simplifies the Nassau and Church of England texts by referring to 'existing canonical disciplines' and links the obligation to sustain Eucharistic communion with the ecumenical quest.

In 1.2.4 'equip' replaces 'assist' and 'transformative' is omitted.

In 1.2.6 'truth' becomes 'the Truth' (presumably referring to Christ as in Jn 14:6) and the language from the Nassau text about 'new and abundant life in the Lord Jesus Christ' is preferred to the Church of England's suggestion of 'the new and abundant life that Christ offers'

4. The life we share with others

The Nassau text

4 The Life We Share with Others: Our Anglican Vocation
(*Jeremiah 31.31-34, Ezekiel. 36.22-28, Matthew 28.16-20, John 17.20-24, 2 Corinthians 8-9, Ephesians 2:11-3:21, James 1.22-27*)

(1) We affirm that Communion is a gift of God: that His people from east and west, north and south, may together declare his glory and be a sign of God's Kingdom. We gratefully acknowledge God's gracious providence extended to us down the ages, our origins in the undivided Church, the rich history of the Church in Britain and Ireland shaped particularly by the Reformation, and our growth into a global communion through the various mission initiatives.

(2) As the Communion continues to develop into a worldwide family of interdependent churches, we also face challenges and opportunities for mission at local, regional, and international levels. We cherish our faith and mission heritage as offering us unique opportunities for mission collaboration, for discovery of the life of the whole gospel and for reconciliation and shared mission with the Church throughout the world.

(3) The member Churches acknowledge that their common mission is a mission shared with other churches and traditions not party to this covenant. It is with all the saints that we will comprehend the fuller dimensions of Christ's redemptive and immeasurable love.

(4) We commit ourselves to answering God's call to share in his healing and reconciling mission for our blessed but broken and hurting world, and, with mutual accountability, to share our God-given spiritual and material resources in this task.

(5) In this mission, which is the Mission of Christ [7], we commit ourselves

1. to proclaim the Good News of the Kingdom of God
2. to teach, baptize and nurture new believers;
3. to respond to human need by loving service;
4. to seek to transform unjust structures of society; and
5. to strive to safeguard the integrity of creation and to sustain and renew the life of the earth.

⁷ Cf. The five Marks of Mission as set out in the MISSIO Report of 1999, building on work at ACC-6 and ACC-8.

The Church of England text

4 The Life We Share with Others: Our Anglican Vocation

(1) We affirm that Communion is a gift of God: that His people from east and west, north and south, may together declare his glory and be a sign of God's Kingdom. We gratefully acknowledge God's gracious providence extended to us down the ages, our origins in the Church of the Apostles, the ancient common traditions, the rich history of the Church in Britain and Ireland shaped by the Reformation, and our growth into a global communion through the missionary work of the Church.

(2) As the Communion continues to develop into a worldwide family of interdependent churches, we also face challenges and opportunities for mission at local, regional, and international levels. We cherish the fact that our faith and mission heritage offers us unique opportunities for discovery of the life that the whole gospel offers and for reconciliation and collaboration in mission with the Church throughout the world as we seek to bear witness to the transforming power of God's coming kingdom.

(3) We acknowledge that our common mission is shared with other churches and traditions. It is only with all the saints that we will comprehend the fuller dimensions of Christ's redemptive and immeasurable love.

(4) We commit ourselves to answering God's call to share in his healing and reconciling mission for our blessed but broken and hurting world, and, with mutual accountability, to share our God-given spiritual and material resources in this task.

(5) In this mission, which is the Mission of Christ, we commit ourselves, in accordance with the 'Five Marks of Mission'

1. to proclaim the Good News of the Kingdom of God
2. to teach, baptize and nurture believers;
3. to respond to human need by loving service;
4. to seek to transform unjust structures of society; and
5. to strive to safeguard the integrity of creation and to sustain and renew the life of the earth.

The St Andrew's Draft

Section Two: The Life We Share with Others: Our Anglican Vocation

2.1 Each Church of the Communion affirms:

(2.1.1) that communion is a gift of God: that His people from east and west, north and south, may together declare his glory and be a sign of God's *Reign*. We gratefully acknowledge God's gracious providence extended to us down the ages, **our origins in the Church of the Apostles, the ancient common traditions, the rich history of the Church in Britain and Ireland shaped by the Reformation, and our growth into a global communion through the expanding missionary work of the Church.**

(2.1.2) *the ongoing mission work of the Communion*. As the Communion continues to develop into a worldwide family of interdependent churches, we *embrace* challenges and opportunities for mission at local, regional, and international levels. *In this*, we cherish our faith and mission heritage as offering Anglicans *distinctive* opportunities for mission collaboration.

(2.1.3) that our common mission is a mission shared with other churches and traditions *beyond this covenant*. We *embrace opportunities for the discovery of the life of the whole gospel and for reconciliation and shared mission with the Church throughout the world*. It is with all the saints that we will comprehend the fuller dimensions of Christ's redemptive and immeasurable love.

2.2 In recognition of these affirmations, each Church of the Communion commits itself:

(2.2.1) to answer God's call to evangelisation and to share in his healing and reconciling mission for our blessed but broken, hurting and fallen world, and, with mutual accountability, to share our God-given spiritual and material resources in this task.

(2.2.2) In this mission, which is the Mission of Christ^[8], each Church undertakes:

(2.2.2.a) to proclaim the Good News of the Kingdom of God;

(2.2.2.b) to teach, baptize and nurture new believers;

(2.2.2.c) to respond to human need by loving service;

(2.2.2.d) to seek to transform unjust structures of society; and

(2.2.2.e) to strive to safeguard the integrity of creation and to sustain and renew the life of the earth.

Commentary

The St Andrew's draft divides section 4 of the Nassau and Church of England texts into two, 2.1 and 2.2.

2.1 corresponds to subsections 1-3 of the Nassau and Church of England texts. It has a new subheading that is not in these texts.

In 2.1.1 the word 'reign' replaces the word 'kingdom' in the other two texts. In the second sentence the suggestions made in the Church of England text have been adopted.

In 2.1.2 there is a new introductory sub- heading and four changes in the remainder of the text. The more positive 'embrace' replaces 'face', 'in this' is added at the start of the second sentence, 'distinctive' replaces 'unique.'

In 2.1.3 'beyond this covenant' replaces 'not party to this covenant' in the Nassau text and the suggestion in the Church of England text of simply saying 'other churches and traditions.' The material in the second sentence of this subsection has been moved from its place at the end of the previous subsection in the Nassau and Church of England texts. The Church of England's suggestion of adding 'only' before 'with all the saints' in the last sentence has not been adopted.

2.2 has a new subheading, but the rest of the text follows the Nassau text. The Church of England suggestion of omitting the word 'new' in the second of the marks of mission has not been adopted.

5 Our Unity and Common life

The Nassau Text

5 Our Unity and Common Life

(Numbers 11.16-20, Luke 22.14-27, Acts 2.43-47, 4.32-35, 1 Corinthians 11.23-26, 1 Peter 4:7-11, 5:1-11)

(1) We affirm the historic episcopate, locally adapted in the methods of its administration to the varying needs of the nations and peoples called of God into the

unity of his Church [8] and the central role of bishops as custodians of faith, leaders in mission, and as a visible sign of unity.

(2) We affirm the place of four Instruments of Communion which serve to discern our common mind in communion issues, and to foster our interdependence and mutual accountability in Christ. While each member Church orders and regulates its own affairs through its own system of government and law and is therefore described as autonomous, each church recognises that the member churches of the Anglican Communion are bound together, not juridically by a central legislative or executive authority, but by the Holy Spirit who calls and enables us to live in mutual loyalty and service.

I. Of these four Instruments of Communion, the Archbishop of Canterbury, with whose See Anglicans have historically been in communion, is accorded a primacy of honour and respect as first amongst equals (*primus inter pares*). He calls the Lambeth Conference, and Primates' Meeting, and is President of the Anglican Consultative Council.

II. The Lambeth Conference, under the presidency of the Archbishop of Canterbury, expressing episcopal collegiality worldwide, gathers the bishops for common counsel, consultation and encouragement and serves as an instrument in guarding the faith and unity of the Communion.

III. The Primates' Meeting, presided over by the Archbishop of Canterbury, assembles for mutual support and counsel, monitors global developments and works in full collaboration in doctrinal, moral and pastoral matters that have Communion-wide implications.

IV. The Anglican Consultative Council is a body representative of bishops, clergy and laity of the churches, which co-ordinates aspects of international Anglican ecumenical and mission work.

⁸ Cf. **The Chicago-Lambeth Quadrilateral 1886/1888**

The Church of England text

5 Our Unity and Common Life

(1) We affirm the potential importance of the structures of the Anglican Communion in assisting in the discernment, articulation and exercise of our shared faith and common mission.

(2) The historic episcopate, locally adapted in the methods of its administration to the varying needs of the nations and peoples called of God into the unity of his Church and exercised in a personal, collegial and communal manner.

(3) The ministry of bishops within the whole Church as guardians of faith, leaders in mission, and as a visible sign of unity.

(4) The place of the four ‘Instruments of Communion,’ as instruments of unity and means of communion which serve to discern our common mind in Communion issues, and to foster our interdependence and mutual accountability in Christ.

(5) Each of our churches orders and regulates its own affairs through its own system of government and law and is in that sense autonomous. However we recognise that we are bound together, not juridically by a central legislative or executive authority, but by the Holy Spirit who calls and enables us to preach and live out the gospel in mutual loyalty and service.

The St Andrew’s Draft

3.1 Each Church of the Communion affirms:

(3.1.1) that by our participation in Baptism and Eucharist, we are incorporated into the one body of the Church of Jesus Christ, and called by Christ to pursue all things that make for peace and build up our common life;

*(3.1.2) its resolve to live in a Communion of Churches. Each Church, episcopally led and synodically governed, orders and regulates its own affairs and its local responsibility for mission through its own system of government and law and is therefore described as *autonomous-in-communion*[9]. Churches of the Anglican Communion are not bound together by a central legislative, executive or judicial authority. *Trusting in the Holy Spirit, who calls and enables us to live in mutual affection, commitment and service, we seek to affirm our common life through those Instruments of Communion by which our Churches are enabled to develop a common mind;**

*(3.1.3) the central role of bishops as **guardians** and teachers of faith, leaders in mission, and as a visible sign of unity, representing the universal Church to the local, and the local Church to the universal. This ministry is exercised personally, collegially and within and for the eucharistic community. We receive and maintain the historic threefold ministry of bishops, priests and deacons, ordained for service in the Church of God, as they call all the baptised into the mission of Christ;*

(3.1.4) the importance of instruments in the Anglican Communion to assist in the discernment, articulation and exercise of our shared faith and common life and mission. In addition to the many and varied links which sustain our life together, we acknowledge four particular Instruments which co-operate in the service of Communion:

The Archbishop of Canterbury, with whose See Anglicans have historically been in communion, is accorded a primacy of honour and respect as first amongst equals (*primus inter pares*). As a focus and means of unity, he gathers the Lambeth Conference and Primates’ Meeting, and *presides* in the Anglican Consultative Council;

The Lambeth Conference, expressing episcopal collegiality worldwide, gathers the bishops for common counsel, consultation and encouragement and serves as an

instrument in guarding the faith and unity of the Communion *and equipping the saints for the work of ministry and mission*[10];

The Anglican Consultative Council is comprised of laity, clergy and bishops representative of our Provincial synods. *It facilitates the co-operative work of the Churches of the Anglican Communion, co-ordinates aspects of international Anglican ecumenical and mission work, calls the Churches into mutual responsibility and interdependence, and advises on developing provincial structures*[11];

The Primates' Meeting is called by the Archbishop of Canterbury for mutual support, prayer and counsel. *The Primates and Moderators are called to work as representative of their Provinces in collaboration with one another in mission* and in doctrinal, moral and pastoral matters that have communion-wide implications.

Commentary

This section of the St Andrew's draft includes a lot of new material. As can be seen above, there is a new section heading, 3.1.1 on sacramental participation in the body of Christ and the opening of 3.1.4 on the importance of the Instruments of Communion are almost entirely new, while 3.1.3 on the episcopate greatly extends the second half of section 5 (1) of the Nassau and Church of England texts. 3.1.3 also follows the Church of England suggestion of describing bishops as 'guardians' rather than 'custodians' of the faith.

3.1.2 has a new opening, adds the description of Anglican churches as 'episcopally led and synodically governed', replaces the description of the churches as 'autonomous' with a reference to their being 'autonomous in communion' taken from paragraph 75 of the Windsor Report and adds a new last sentence which links the churches' trust in the Holy Spirit to their commitment to the Instruments of Communion.

The St Andrew's draft follows the Nassau text rather than the Church of England text in including the description of the Instruments of Communion in the main text rather than in the Introduction. It changes the order of the Instruments to reflect the order in which they developed and it offers an expanded description of them that draws on a variety of Communion documents including the ACC constitution and the account of the Primates given in the *Windsor Report* as well as making reference to Eph 4.12.

6 Unity of the Communion

The Nassau Text

6 Unity of the Communion

(*Nehemiah 2.17,18, Mt. 18.15-18, 1 Corinthians 12, 2 Corinthians 4.1-18, 13: 5-10, Galatians 6.1-10*)

Each Church commits itself

(1) in essential matters of common concern, to have regard to the common good of the Communion in the exercise of its autonomy, and to support the work of the Instruments of Communion with the spiritual and material resources available to it.

(2) to spend time with openness and patience in matters of theological debate and discernment to listen and to study with one another in order to comprehend the will of God. Such study and debate is an essential feature of the life of the Church as it seeks to be led by the Spirit into all truth and to proclaim the Gospel afresh in each generation. Some issues, which are perceived as controversial or new when they arise, may well evoke a deeper understanding of the implications of God's revelation to us; others may prove to be distractions or even obstacles to the faith: all therefore need to be tested by shared discernment in the life of the Church.

(3) to seek with other members, through the Church's shared councils, a common mind about matters of essential concern, consistent with the Scriptures, common standards of faith, and the canon law of our churches.

(4) to heed the counsel of our Instruments of Communion in matters which threaten the unity of the Communion and the effectiveness of our mission. While the Instruments of Communion have no juridical or executive authority in our Provinces, we recognise them as those bodies by which our common life in Christ is articulated and sustained, and which therefore carry a moral authority which commands our respect.

(5) to seek the guidance of the Instruments of Communion, where there are matters in serious dispute among churches that cannot be resolved by mutual admonition and counsel:

1. by submitting the matter to the Primates Meeting
2. if the Primates believe that the matter is not one for which a common mind has been articulated, they will seek it with the other instruments and their councils
3. finally, on this basis, the Primates will offer guidance and direction.

(6) We acknowledge that in the most extreme circumstances, where member churches choose not to fulfil the substance of the covenant as understood by the Councils of the Instruments of Communion, we will consider that such churches will have relinquished for themselves the force and meaning of the covenant's purpose, and a process of restoration and renewal will be required to re-establish their covenant relationship with other member churches.

The Church of England Text

We commit ourselves

(1) in essential matters of common concern, to have regard to the common good of the Communion in the exercise of our autonomy, and to support the work of the Instruments of Communion with our spiritual and material resources available to it;

(2) to spend time with openness and patience in matters of theological debate and discernment to listen and to study with one another in order to comprehend the will of God;

(3) to seek with other members, through the Church's shared councils, a common mind about matters of essential concern, consistent with the Scriptures, common standards of faith, and the canon law of our churches;

(4) to heed the counsel of our Instruments of Communion in matters which threaten the unity of the Communion, our fellowship with other churches and the effectiveness of our mission. While the Instruments of Communion have no juridical or executive authority in our Provinces, we recognise them as those bodies by which our common life in Christ is articulated and sustained, and which therefore carry a spiritual, pastoral and doctrinal authority which commands our respect;

(5) to submit matters in serious dispute that cannot be resolved by mutual admonition and counsel to the Primates so that (in accordance with the responsibilities given to them by the Lambeth Conferences of 1988 and 1998) they can offer guidance on how they may be resolved, either on the basis of the existing position of the Communion, or after the development of a common mind through consultation with the local churches of the Communion and their bishops and with the other Instruments of Communion.

(6) to refrain from intervening in the life of other Anglican churches (sc provinces) except in extraordinary circumstances where such intervention has been specifically authorised by the relevant Instruments of Communion.

(7) Acknowledging the need for the exercise of discipline within the life of the Church in order to preserve its holiness and the effectiveness of its mission and to ensure that those who have erred are brought to repentance, healing and restoration (Mt 18:15-20, 1 Cor 5:1-5, 2 Cor 2:5-11, 1 Tim 1:20), we commit ourselves to accept the patterns of discipline involved in being part of the Anglican Covenant. In the most extreme circumstances, where member churches choose not to fulfil the substance of the covenant as understood by the Instruments of Communion, we will consider such churches to have relinquished for themselves the force and meaning of the covenant's purpose, and we accept that a process of restoration and renewal will be required to re-establish their covenant relationship with other member churches.

The St Andrew's Draft

3.2 Acknowledging our interdependent life, each Church of the Communion commits itself:

(3.2.1) to have regard to the common good of the Communion in the exercise of its autonomy, and to support the work of the Instruments of Communion with the spiritual and material resources available to it;

(3.2.2) to respect the constitutional autonomy of all of the Churches of the Anglican Communion, while upholding the interdependent life and mutual responsibility of the Churches, and the responsibility of each to the Communion as a whole[12];

(3.2.3) to spend time with openness and patience in matters of theological debate and reflection to listen, pray and study with one another in order to discern the will of God. Such prayer, study and debate is an essential feature of the life of the Church as it seeks to be led by the Spirit into all truth and to proclaim the Gospel afresh in each generation. Some issues, which are perceived as controversial or new when they arise, may well evoke a deeper understanding of the implications of God's revelation to us; others may prove to be distractions or even obstacles to the faith: all therefore need to be tested by shared discernment in the life of the Church.

(3.2.4) to seek with other Churches, through the Communion's shared councils, a common mind about matters understood to be of essential concern, consistent with the Scriptures, common standards of faith, and the canon law of our churches.

(3.2.5) to act with diligence, care and caution in respect to actions, either proposed or enacted, at a provincial or local level, which, in its own view or the expressed view of any Province or in the view of any one of the Instruments of Communion, are deemed to threaten the unity of the Communion and the effectiveness or credibility of its mission, and to consent to the following principles and procedural elements:

(3.2.5.a) to undertake wide consultation with the other churches of the Anglican Communion and with the Instruments and Commissions of the Communion;

(3.2.5.b) to accept the legitimacy of processes for communion-wide evaluation which any of the Instruments of Communion may commission, according to such procedures as are appended to this covenant;

(3.2.5.c) to be ready to participate in mediated conversation between parties, which may be in conflict, according to such procedures as are appended to this covenant;

(3.2.5.d) to be willing to receive from the Instruments of Communion a request to adopt a particular course of action in respect of the matter under dispute. While the Instruments of Communion have no legislative, executive or judicial authority in our Provinces, except where provided in their own laws, we recognise them as those bodies by which our common life in Christ is articulated and sustained, and which therefore carry a moral authority which commands our respect.

(3.2.5.e) Any such request would not be binding on a Church unless recognised as such by that Church. However, commitment to this covenant entails an acknowledgement that in the most extreme circumstances, where a Church chooses not to adopt the request of the Instruments of Communion, that decision may be understood by the Church itself, or by the resolution of the Instruments of Communion, as a relinquishment by that Church of the force and meaning of the covenant's purpose, until they re-establish their covenant relationship with other member Churches.

(3.2.6) to have in mind that our bonds of affection and the love of Christ compel us always to seek the highest possible degree of communion.

Commentary

As in the previous section, this section of the St Andrew's text has lots of new material. That in 3.2.2 comes from the schedule to the Primates' Dar es Salaam Communiqué while the remainder seems too have come from the CDG itself.

There are three significant changes to the Nassau text.

- All specific reference to the role of the Primates has gone.
- A set of procedures by which all the Instruments of Communion would be involved in responding to controversial actions by particular churches is suggested instead. This idea is explored further in the draft appendix to the St Andrew's statement which is included as Appendix 1 I this report.
- Churches would be judged to have relinquished the 'force and meaning of the covenant's purpose' not by failing 'to fulfil the substance of the covenant' (as in the Nassau text) but by refusing a request for action by the Instruments of Communion. This means in effect that what would exclude a church from the Communion would not be doctrinal or moral offences, but solely the ecclesiological offence of refusing to obey the Instruments of Communion.

The suggestions made by the Church of England that:

- the Instruments of Communion should be concerned with matters which threatened the fellowship of the Anglican Communion with other churches
- the Instruments of Communion should be said to have 'spiritual, pastoral and doctrinal authority'
- there should be material relating to interventions in the life of other Anglican churches and to the need for the exercise of discipline in the life of the Church.

have not been adopted.

7. Declaration

The Nassau Text

7 Our Declaration

(Psalms 46, 72.18,19, 150, Acts10.34-44, 2 Corinthians 13.13, Jude 24-25)

With joy and with firm resolve, we declare our Churches to be partners in this Anglican Covenant, releasing ourselves for fruitful service and binding ourselves more closely in the truth and love of Christ, to whom with the Father and the Holy Spirit be glory for ever. Amen.

The Church of England Text

7 Our Declaration

With joy and with firm resolve, we declare our Churches to be partners in this Anglican Covenant, releasing ourselves for fruitful service in the proclamation of the gospel and binding ourselves more closely in the truth and love of Christ, to whom with the Father and the Holy Spirit be glory for ever. Amen.

The St Andrew's Draft

Our Declaration

With joy and with firm resolve, we declare our Churches to be partakers in this Anglican Covenant, offering ourselves for fruitful service and binding ourselves more closely in the truth and love of Christ, to whom with the Father and the Holy Spirit be glory for ever. Amen.

“Now may the God of Peace, who brought again from the dead our Lord Jesus, the great shepherd of the sheep, by the blood of the eternal covenant, make you complete in everything good so that you may do his will, working among us that which is pleasing in his sight, through Jesus Christ, to whom be the glory forever and ever. Amen.” (Hebrews 13.20, 21)

Comment

Like the Preamble the declaration section of the St Andrew's draft is unnumbered. In terms of its content, the first sentence follows the Nassau text exactly, not adopting the Church of England's suggested expansion of 'fruitful service' into 'fruitful service in the proclamation of the gospel.' The second sentence, which is entirely new, is a quotation from Hebrews 13, the significance of which is presumably seen to lie in the combination of a reference to the eternal covenant with the idea of God being at work among his people to make them 'complete in everything good.'

Appendix I – Proposed procedure for resolving disputes.

An Anglican Covenant - Draft Appendix

Framework Procedures for the Resolution of Covenant Disagreements

1. General Principles

1.1. All processes for the resolution of covenant disagreements which threaten the unity of the Communion and the effectiveness or credibility of its mission shall be characterised by the Christian virtues of charity, humility, patience and gentleness and the canonical principles of fairness, transparency, and reasoned decision-making.

1.2. No process shall affect the autonomy of any Church of the Communion. The term “Church” and all terms in this Appendix take their meaning from the Covenant itself.

1.3. No process shall exceed five years as from the date upon which a Church consults under Paragraph 3 of this Appendix.

1.4. Any matter involving relinquishment by a Church of the force and meaning of the Covenant purposes must be decided solely by that Church or by the Anglican Consultative Council in accordance with Paragraph 8 of this Appendix.

1.5. Each Communion body or instrument involved in the following procedures shall make its own rules, in consultation with the other Instruments of Communion, for the transaction of its business in accordance with the Covenant, the Framework Procedures and the Christian virtues and canonical principles set out in Paragraph 1.1 of this Appendix.

2. The Principle of Informal Conversation

2.1. If a Church (X) proposes to act or acts in any way that another Church (Y) or an Instrument of Communion (Z) claims to threaten the unity of the Communion and the effectiveness or credibility of its mission, then X Church, Y Church and Z instrument shall engage in informal conversation, as an act of communion, to try to resolve the matter.

2.2. The Anglican Consultative Council shall be disqualified from making a claim under 2.1, on the basis that it may later make a decision as to the relinquishment on the force and meaning of the Covenant purpose under paragraph 8, but it shall not be disqualified from entering into informal conversation under 2.1..

[ie 2.2 is about natural justice and keeps ACC in reserve for Paragraph 8]

3. The Principle of Consultation

3.1. If informal conversation fails in the view of X, Y or Z, or if X Church itself considers that an action or proposed action might threaten Communion unity and mission, then X Church must consult the Archbishop of Canterbury on the matter.

3.2. Within one month of being consulted, the Archbishop of Canterbury must either (a) seek to resolve the matter personally through pastoral guidance or (b) refer the matter to three Assessors, appointed as appropriate by the Archbishop.

3.3. If after one month of its issue, the pastoral guidance of the Archbishop is unsuccessful as determined by the Archbishop, the Archbishop shall as soon as practically possible refer the matter to the Assessors who shall act in accordance with Paragraph 3.4.

3.4. Having considered whether the matter involves a threat to the unity and mission of the Communion according to Article 3.2.5 of the Covenant, the Assessors shall recommend to the Archbishop, within one month of receiving the referral, one of the following routes:

(a) if it is clear in the opinion of the Assessors that the matter involves a threat to the unity or mission of the Communion and that time may be of the essence, a request from the Archbishop of Canterbury;

(b) if it is unclear in the opinion of the Assessors whether the matter involves a threat to the unity or mission of the Communion and time is of the essence, referral to another Instrument of Communion;

(c) if it is unclear in the opinion of the Assessors whether the matter involves a threat to the unity or mission of the Communion, if time is not of the essence, and if the case would benefit from rigorous theological study, referral to a Commission for evaluation; or:

(d) if it is clear that the matter does not involve threat to the unity or mission of the Communion, mediation.

3.5. The Archbishop of Canterbury, having considered the Assessors' recommendation, and within one month of its receipt, shall either: (a) as an Instrument of Communion, issue a request to any Church involved; (b) refer the matter to another Instrument of Communion; (c) refer the matter to a Commission of the Communion for evaluation; or (d) send the matter for mediation.

4. Route 1: A Request of the Archbishop of Canterbury

4.1. When the Archbishop of Canterbury makes a request to a Church, that Church must within six months of receiving it (a) accept the request or (b) reject the request. The absence of a response will be considered as a rejection.

4.2. If a Church rejects the request, that Church may within three months of receiving the request appeal against it to the Joint Standing Committee of the Anglican Consultative Council and the Primates. The Church may appeal when it considers that there has been no threat to the unity or mission of the Communion.

4.3. On appeal, and within three months, the Joint Standing Committee must decide whether there has been a threat to the unity or mission of the Communion.

4.4. If the appeal is successful, the Joint Standing Committee shall certify immediately that the matter is closed subject to Articles 3.2.1, 3.2.4 and 3.2.5b of the Covenant.

4.5. If the appeal is lost, the Archbishop shall submit the request, rejection and appeal decision to the Anglican Consultative Council which shall deal with the matter in accordance with Paragraph 8.

5. Route 2: A Referral to another Instrument of Communion

5.1. When the Archbishop of Canterbury refers the matter to another Instrument of Communion, that Instrument must within one year of receiving the referral decide

whether there has been a threat to the unity or mission of the Communion. Having considered the matter, the Instrument shall make a request to any Church involved.

5.2. A Church shall within six months of receiving the request either (a) accept the request or (b) reject the request. The absence of a response will be considered as a rejection.

5.3. If a Church accepts the request, the Instrument of Communion to which referral is made shall as soon as is convenient certify that the matter is closed subject to Articles 3.2.1, 3.2.4 and 3.2.5b of the Covenant.

5.4. If a Church rejects the request, the Instrument of Communion to which the referral is made shall at its next meeting submit the request and rejection to the Anglican Consultative Council which shall deal with the matter in accordance with Paragraph 8.

6. Route 3: An Evaluation by a Commission

6.1. When the Archbishop of Canterbury decides to refer the matter to a Commission in the Communion, he shall choose which Commission in consultation with the Secretary General of the Anglican Communion.

[NOTE: This is without prejudice to the entitlement of any other Instrument of Communion requesting the Archbishop to set up Commissions or to any other Instrument of Communion likewise setting up such Commissions.]

6.2. The Commission shall engage in study of the issues involved in the matter, bringing in expertise as needed, and shall evaluate the acceptability of the act or proposed act of any Church involved.

6.3. Within eighteen months of the referral, the Commission shall submit its evaluation to an Instrument of Communion other than the Anglican Consultative Council as determined by the Archbishop of Canterbury. Having considered the evaluation, the Instrument shall issue a request to any Church involved.

6.4. If a Church accepts the request, the Instrument of Communion to which the evaluation is submitted shall certify as soon as is convenient that the matter is closed subject to Articles 3.2.1, 3.2.4 and 3.2.5b of the Covenant.

6.5. If a Church rejects the request, the Instrument of Communion to which the evaluation is submitted shall send the request and rejection to the Anglican Consultative Council which shall process the matter in accordance with Paragraph 8.

7. Route 4: Mediation

7.1. When the Archbishop of Canterbury decides on mediation, the Assessors shall work with the parties to set up a mediation process.

7.2. The parties shall appoint an independent third party who shall assist the parties involved to achieve a mutually acceptable resolution of the points of disagreement.

7.3. The mediator shall participate actively in the mediation, offering suggestions for resolution, trying to reconcile opposing assertions, and appeasing feelings of resentment between the parties.

7.4. The mediator has no decision-making authority and cannot compel the parties to accept a settlement.

7.5. On each anniversary of the establishment of the mediation, the Assessors shall report on the process to the Archbishop of Canterbury. Within three years of the establishment of the mediation, the Archbishop of Canterbury together with the Joint Standing Committee of the Anglican Consultative Council and Primates` Meeting shall certify the conclusion of the mediation process.

7.6. If a party refuses to enter mediation, it will be presumed to have threatened the unity of the Communion and the effectiveness or credibility of its mission, under Article 3.2.5 of the Covenant, and the matter shall be dealt with at the next meeting of the Anglican Consultative Council in accordance with Paragraph 8.

8. Rejection of a Request from an Instrument of Communion

8.1. If a Church rejects a request of an Instrument of Communion, that Instrument shall send the request and rejection to the Anglican Consultative Council.

8.2. At its next meeting, the Council shall decide whether the rejection of the request is compatible with the Covenant.

8.3. If the Council decides that the rejection of the request is compatible with the Covenant, the matter is closed subject to Articles 3.2.1, 3.2.4 and 3.2.5b of the Covenant.

8.4. If the Council decides that the rejection is incompatible with the Covenant, then during the course of that meeting of the Council either (a) the Church involved may declare voluntarily that it relinquishes the force and meaning of the purposes of the Covenant, or (b) the Council shall resolve whether the Church involved may be understood to have relinquished the force and meaning of the purposes of the Covenant.

8.5. If a declaration or resolution of relinquishment is issued, the Anglican Consultative Council must as soon as is practicable initiate a process of restoration with the Church involved in consultation with all the Churches of the Communion and the other Instruments of Communion.

Commentary

This section of the St Andrew's material is an attempt to flesh out in more detail the basic suggestions for dealing with disputes within the Communion set out in section 3.2.5 of the St Andrew's text. Although the suggestions are fairly detailed, what is being proposed in them is quite straightforward..

What is being suggested is that if there is a matter under dispute that cannot be resolved by informal conversation between the parties involved the matter will be referred to the Archbishop of Canterbury who will either seek to resolve it personally or refer it on to three Assessors appointed by him. Depending on their judgement of the importance and urgency of the issue they will make a recommendation to the Archbishop who will decide whether he should deal with it, or whether it should be dealt with by another Instrument of Communion, by a Commission of the Communion, or by mediation. In the first three cases a request for a certain line of action to be taken will eventually be issued and refusal to accede to a request will lead to a referral to the ACC (subject to a possible appeal to the Joint Standing Committee and the Primates in the case of a request from the Archbishop of Canterbury) which will decide whether this refusal is compatible with the Covenant. Referral to the ACC would also follow if a church refused to enter mediation.

If the ACC decides that a church has acted in a way that is incompatible with the Covenant either it or the ACC may decide that it has 'relinquished the force and meaning of the purposes of the Covenant.' If this happens, the ACC must initiate a process of restoration as soon as possible.

Unlike the suggestions in the Nassau text, this proposed procedure gives the Archbishop of Canterbury and the ACC rather than the Primates the key roles in handling disputes within the Communion.

It should be noted that the commentary on the St Andrew's draft issued by the CDG describes it as 'a tentative draft' that 'will need much scrutiny and careful analysis.'

Appendix 2 Comments from Dr Ephraim Radner

These comments were posted on Kendall Harmon's blog *Titus One Nine*. They explain why the St Andrew's draft no longer gives a central role to the Primates Meeting.

'Several quick comments from one who was a part of the Design Group:

1. The articulation of a procedural "framework" was necessary, for a host of reasons, including legality, prudence, justice, and efficacy. As #23 notes, this had as its consequence a number of elements, including enumerated detail ("prolixity" is not exactly a fair charge, I think, given the nature of these kinds of outlines which, in other contexts, tend to be far more, not less, extended). It must be said that responses from the Communion on this section in the first draft were uniformly concerned about the vagueness of what had earlier been proposed, a vagueness that might move against the reasons listed above for change. And this concern was voiced by parties of both "liberal" and "conservative" character. It should be said, however, that the movement towards such concrete outlines is surely not going to be welcomed by many for whom the very idea of covenantal discipline is repugnant.
2. The shift away from making the Primates' Meeting a gateway of evaluative articulation for the Communion was motivated by several reasons. It is not clear that this is a role the Primates themselves wish to assume; it quite evident that this is a role

that the Primates' Meeting has currently shown itself incapable of performing (being at present divided amongst itself in rather spectacular ways, and seemingly unable to speak decisively into its own midst); it is not clear that there is sufficient distance from or lack of implication within, among the Primates, the very disputes that might be at issue. Certainly, there is room in the present outline for the Primates' Meeting to exercise self-discipline, to initiate procedures, and to provide clear evaluations and directives.

3. The ACC as a last evaluative body regarding covenantal faithfulness might suggest itself for some legal reasons, among others, given that they are the only Instrument of Communion constitutionally charged with membership decisions (although not currently this particular one). The relationship of Provinces to the ACC is already defined, in this regard, and this definition may provide some useful foundation for the implementation of these suggested procedural endpoints. It needs to be said, however, that there is probably no uniform sense within the Communion or even within the Covenant Design Group about this conclusion. The notion of erecting a final "tribunal", separate from the current Instruments or structures of the Communion is one that has long been resisted in the Communion (dating from the first Lambeth Conference, in fact). But short of that, it is not clear what the alternatives are, and none were suggested within the responses we received.

4. It should be noted that there are several means available, in the face of dispute or the threat of danger (in terms of teaching and/or unity), to move more quickly, indeed even bypassing the various procedural options outlined in the appendix. The suggested framework is deliberately not "one-size-fits-all", provides the Instruments of Communion (apart from the ACC) with direct engagement within matters that concern the Communion's integrity of life, and quite explicitly requires a range of disciplined decisions by all. The fact that individual churches might choose to ignore their commitments, or choose to contravene them, or choose to reject counsel, admonishment, and even common judgment is simply a part of what it means to be a free partner within a Covenant that involves multiple parties (i.e. the Church of Christ!). As #16 has rightly pointed out, within Anglicanism, both in its history and in its self-articulated self-ordering, the acknowledgement of such freedom and its rejectionary capacities gives rise to a particular way of ordering a response to this on the ground. Other Christian traditions have indeed chosen to order things differently and on the basis of differing kinds of acknowledgement concerning the nature of the Church's powers and choices, through transnational centralized authorities, congregationally-located authority, the comings and goings within the porousness of federation, and so on. Are these alternatives better or worse in the light of the Church's larger history? It is an interesting moment for all of us as we ponder just such fundamental questions. We believe, however, that the current draft at least points in the direction that is congruent with our long-standing commitments as Anglican Christians.

5. Readers should remember that this is second draft of what will prove to be at least 4 versions (the fourth, we hope, being the final one). It is to go to the bishops at the Lambeth Conference, where it will receive quite explicit and concrete comment and response, which will inform the 3rd draft later this year. It should by now be clear where the direction of the Covenant is oriented, including its basic form and the basic hopes and theology that structure its content. But of all the sections, surely the last must continue to be amended and refined on the basis of the wisdom of the

Communion itself. This is not the last version, and the constructive responses of all are in fact being and will continue to be carefully received, assessed and used.’

Summary Comments

A comparison of the three texts makes it clear that the CDG has taken an evolutionary rather than a revolutionary approach to its task. What we have been given is not something entirely new but a revision of the Nassau text, which adopts some of the suggestions made in the Church of England response and which also introduces material from a variety of other Anglican sources.

For the most part the revision is fairly conservative. However, there are major changes in section 3.2 and the draft appendix with the disappearance of the role of the Primates in the affairs of the communion as envisaged in the *Windsor Report* and the Nassau and Church of England texts and its replacement by an enhanced role for the Archbishop of Canterbury and the ACC within a detailed procedure for handling disputes within the Communion.

A number of issues are raised by the proposals in the St Andrew’s draft which will require careful consideration.

- There is the practical issue of whether the Archbishop of Canterbury and his staff and/or the ACCAs presently constituted have the capacity to handle the disputes procedure envisaged in the draft appendix.
- There is the political issue of whether an enhanced role for the ACC will be acceptable to those large numbers of conservatives within the Communion who regard the ACC with profound distrust.
- There is the ecclesiological issue of whether the final authority in the Communion should lie with the ACC as a synodical body consisting of bishops, clergy and laity from around the Communion or with the Primates meeting as the gathering of the senior bishops of the Communion.
- The fact that the draft appendix sees refusing requests for action made to them as the sole reason for churches being excluded from the Communion raises the unresolved issue of whether the current disputes within the Communion are primarily ecclesiological or doctrinal and moral in nature. That is to say, are the difficulties with TEC and the Anglican Church in Canada primarily due to their having broken the unwritten rules of the Communion or because they have departed from the witness of Scripture and the Catholic Tradition in key areas of faith and morals?
- The St Andrew’s draft declines to adopt the suggestion in the Church of England response that their should be reference to the need for **‘the exercise of discipline within the life of the Church in order to preserve its holiness and the effectiveness of its mission and to ensure that those who have erred are brought to repentance, healing and restoration’** and there is no alternative reference to the principle of discipline. This is a potentially significant omission because there are many in the

Communion who would argue that the proper exercise of Godly discipline is essential to the well being of the Church and that this point needs to be clearly established in text of any Anglican covenant.

- Finally, there is no reference to the question of intervention across provincial boundaries. Arguably this subject needs to be dealt with by the Covenant so that disputes about the legitimacy or otherwise of such interventions do not continue to cause the sort of damage to the life of the Communion that we have seen over the past few years.

M B Davie 8.2.08